Hartmut Esser und Kerstin Hoenig

Ability- oder Nobility-Tracking?

Die theoretische und empirische Revision einer verbreiteten Auffassung
Ein Vergleich der 16 deutschen Bundesländer mit den Daten der
“National Educational Panel Study” (NEPS).
The Standardposition
“... it can be taken for granted that early tracking is associated ... with the generation of more educational inequality with particular disadvantage for lower class and migrant families.” (Müller&Kogan 2010: 227)

“Countries with a more strongly differentiated (school-type tracked) educational system tend to have higher levels of inequality of educational opportunity by social class and race/ethnicity.” (van de Wherfhorst&Miijs 2010: 422)

Really?

Stronger educational inequality and inequity ...

... without gains in efficiency!
The "Model of Ability Tracking"
MoAbiT
NOBILITY
Tracking?

Abilities

SES

Attainment

School/Class

Achievement
The General Model
... everywhere!
Ability Tracking 1:
Standardposition
Tracking

School Type
School/Class

School Type
School/Class

SES-Level
Quality

ABEL-Level
Homogeneity

Beliefs/Motives
Aspirations

Stereotypes
Risk Aversion

Sorting

Attainment

Ressources
Activities

Abilities/Achievement ES

SES

Resources
Activities

Beliefs/Motives
Aspirations

Stereotypes
Risk Aversion

Sorting

Attainment

School Type
School/Class

SES-Level
Quality

ABEL-Level
Homogeneity

Tracking

Parents
Evaluations

Teachers

Beliefs/Motives
Aspirations

Stereotypes
Risk Aversion

Tracking

Parents
Evaluations

Teachers
Abilities/Achievement ES

School Type
School/Class

Secondary Effects

Tertiary Effects

ABL-Level Homogeneity

SES-Level Quality

Tracking

Sorting

Attainment

Primary Effects

Parents Evaluations

Tertiary Effects

Secondary Effects

Teachers

Primary Effects

Secondary Effects

Tertiary Effects

Primary Effects

Secondary Effects

Tertiary Effects

Primary Effects

Secondary Effects

Tertiary Effects
Ability Tracking 2:
„Meritocratic“
Sorting
Abilities/Achievement ES

SES

Primary Effects

No Choice!

No Discrimination

Sorting

Attainment

School Type
School/Class

ABL-Level
Homogeneity

SES-Level
Quality

Quality

Tracking

Achievement
Abilities/Achievement

SES Level

Primary Effects

No Choice!

No Discrimination

ABILITY Sorting

Attainment

School Type
School/Class

Tracking

ABL-Level Homogeneity

SES-Level Quality

Achievement
Abilities/Achievement ES

Primary Effects

No Choice!

No Discrimination

ABILITY Sorting

ABILITY Attainment

School Type
School/Class

Tracking

ABL-Level Homogeneity

SES-Level Quality

Achievement
 Abilities/Achievement

SES
Primary Effects
No Choice!
No Discrimination

ABILITY Sorting
ABILITY Attainment

CURRICULUM HOMOGENIZATION

Tracking
ABL-Level Homogeneity
SES-Level Quality

Achievement
Abilities/Achievement ES

Primary Effects

SES

No Choice!

No Discrimination

ABILITY Sorting

ABILITY Attainment

EFFICIENCY

Tracking

ABL-Level Homogeneity

SES-Level Quality

Achievement
Ability Tracking improves achievement ... without increasing educational inequality and inequity!
System-Effects
Abilities/Achievement ES

Primary Effects

No Choice!
No Discrimination

ABILITY Sorting
ABILITY Attainment

Efficiency

Tracking

ABL-Level Homogeneity
SES-Level Quality

Achievement
No Choice!

No Discrimination

ABILITY Sorting

ABILITY Attainment

ABILITY Tracking

EFFICIENCY

ABL-Level Homogeneity

SES-Level Quality

ABILITY/ Achievement ES

SES

Primary Effects

No

ACHIEVEMENT
Ability Tracking improves achievement ... without increasing educational inequality and inequity ...

... if ABILITY Tracking!
Hypotheses
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>General Effects</th>
<th>Attainment</th>
<th>Homogenization</th>
<th>Achievement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Social background</td>
<td>SES</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abilities</td>
<td>ABL</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Achievement before</td>
<td>ACE</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marks/Recommend. Aspirations</td>
<td>REC</td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ASP</td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Level SES</td>
<td>LSES</td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Level ABL</td>
<td>LABL</td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Hom ABL</td>
<td>HABL</td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schooltype/Track</td>
<td>GYM</td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>System-Effects</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tracking</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>≤0 0</td>
<td>≥0 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SES *T</td>
<td>0 0</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LSES *T</td>
<td>0 0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABL *T</td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LABL *T</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HABL *T</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Set Up
German Country States and their Educational Systems

von Below 2006, 2011
Helbig&Nikolai 2015
Büchler 2016
Bindingness & Control

neither & nor
Index (Helbig&Nikolai 2015, Abb. 28: 286)

2   ---
3   BE, HB, HE, SH
4   NW, RP, MV
5   BB, HH, NI, SL, ST, TH
6   BY
7   BW, SN
8   ---
Index (Helbig&Nikolai 2015, Abb. 28: 286)

2    ---
3    BE, HB, HE, SH
4    NW, RP, MV
5    BB, HH, NI, SL, ST, TH
6    BY
7    BW, SN
8    ---
Data
NEPS

(„National Educational Panel Study“)
Starting Cohort 3
three waves
5th, 6th and 7th grade
Results
1. Attainment
2. Homogenization
3. Achievement
4. Homogeneity & Homogenization
5. Who Gains?
1. Attainment
2. Homogenization
3. Achievement
4. Homogeneity & Homogenization
5. Who Gains?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>General Effects</th>
<th>Attainment</th>
<th>Homogenization</th>
<th>Achievement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SES</td>
<td>+</td>
<td><strong>0.016</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABL</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACE</td>
<td>+</td>
<td><strong>0.555</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REC</td>
<td>+</td>
<td><strong>2.461</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASP</td>
<td>+</td>
<td><strong>3.419</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Level</th>
<th>SES</th>
<th>LSES</th>
<th>LABL</th>
<th>HABL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASP</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Schooltype/Track</th>
<th>GYM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>System-Effects</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tracking</td>
<td>T</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SES</td>
<td>≤0</td>
<td>-0.438</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.009</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LSES</td>
<td>+</td>
<td><strong>0.775</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LABL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HABL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interaction-Effects</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABL</td>
<td>+</td>
<td><strong>0.775</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LABL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HABL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| R²                                  | 0.59  |
| N                                   | 3150  |

**no change** of SES-influence

**increase** of ACE-influence
1. Attainment
2. Homogenization
3. Achievement
4. Homogeneity & Homogenization
5. Who Gains?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social background</th>
<th>Abilities</th>
<th>Achievement before</th>
<th>Marks/Recommend.</th>
<th>Aspirations</th>
<th>General Effects</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SES</td>
<td>SES</td>
<td>SES</td>
<td>SES</td>
<td>SES</td>
<td>SES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABL</td>
<td>ABL</td>
<td>ABL</td>
<td>ABL</td>
<td>ABL</td>
<td>ABL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REC</td>
<td>REC</td>
<td>REC</td>
<td>REC</td>
<td>REC</td>
<td>REC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASP</td>
<td>ASP</td>
<td>ASP</td>
<td>ASP</td>
<td>ASP</td>
<td>ASP</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School LevelSES</th>
<th>School LevelABL</th>
<th>School HomABL</th>
<th>Schooltype/Track</th>
<th>System-Effects</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LSES</td>
<td>LABLE</td>
<td>HABLE</td>
<td>GYM</td>
<td>Tracking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>SES*T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>LSES*T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>ABL*T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>LABLE*T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>HABLE*T</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Interaction-Effects**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interaction-Effects</th>
<th>R²</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>+ 0.002</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>2717</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**increase of ABL-Homogeneity**
1. Attainment
2. Homogenization
3. Achievement
4. Homogeneity & Homogenization
5. Who Gains?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>General Effects</th>
<th>Attainment</th>
<th>Homogenization</th>
<th>Achievement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SES</td>
<td>ABL</td>
<td>NEPS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social background Abilities Achievement before Marks/Recommend. Aspirations</td>
<td>SES</td>
<td>ABL</td>
<td>REC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Level SES School Level ABL School Hom ABL</td>
<td>SES</td>
<td>ABL</td>
<td>HABL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schooltype/Track</td>
<td>GYM</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>LSES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>System-Effects</td>
<td></td>
<td>Tracking</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Interaction-Effects</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R²</td>
<td>N</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tracking</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>SES</td>
<td>LSES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interaction-Effects</td>
<td>0.52</td>
<td>2717</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Observations:**
- **no change of SES-influence**
- **increase of LABL-influence**
Summary
### Social Background

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abilities</th>
<th>Achievement</th>
<th>Marks/Recommend.</th>
<th>Aspirations</th>
<th>System-Effects</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SES</td>
<td>ABL/ACE</td>
<td>REC</td>
<td>ASP</td>
<td>Tracking</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### School Level

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SES</th>
<th>ABL</th>
<th>Homogeneous</th>
<th>Achievement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LSES</td>
<td>LAMES</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>0.023</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LABL</td>
<td></td>
<td>-0.640</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HABL</td>
<td></td>
<td>+ 0.625</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Schooltype/Track

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SES</th>
<th>Tracking</th>
<th>+0.002</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LSES</td>
<td>+0.009</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LABL*</td>
<td>+0.775</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HABL*</td>
<td>+0.421</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### General Effects

- Ability Tracking improves achievement
- ... without increasing educational inequality and inequity ...

### System-Effects

- \( R^2 \) = 0.59
- \( N \) = 3150
- \( N \) = 2717
- \( N \) = 2717
1. Attainment
2. Homogenization
3. Achievement
4. **Homogeneity & Homogenization**
5. Who Gains?

better „match“ and „focus“ of instruction!

stronger incentives for engaged instruction!

dummies for ABL, LABL, T and HET/HOM
... combination of homogeneity and homogenization always best!

... basic structure remains with all controls!
1. Attainment
2. Homogenization
3. Achievement
4. Homogeneity & Homogenization
5. Who Gains?
... low achievers
Summary
Ability Tracking improves achievement without increasing educational inequality and inequity ...

... via ABL-Homogeneity and Homogenization ...

... and gains especially for low achievers!